

Report of: This report covers the main period in office of Museji Ahmed Takolia CBE who took up his appointment on 5th October 2021.

Title: CoRE Annual Report 2021-2022

Ward: City-wide

Member Presenting Report: Museji Ahmed Takolia CBE,
Independent Chair of CoRE.

Recommendations:

For Bristol City Council to:

- Note report and contribution locally and nationally
- Continue supporting implementation of the strategic work and recommendations of the Commission on Race Equality

Summary:

This Annual Report of CoRE summarises the activities of the Commission during 2021-22 and its return to in-person events and meetings.

More specifically it reports on:

- The activities undertaken between October 2021 and September 2022 by the CoRE Independent Chair and BSWN, the Secretariat.
- CoRE's main work streams which include Economy, Jobs and Skills, Health and Education.

The significant issues in the report are:

The report will provide progress against milestones within Economy, Jobs and Skills, Health and Education work streams, and its objective is to tackle systemic racial inequality.

Policy

Please refer to page 8 for full update on relevant policy contributions.

Consultation

a) Internal

The secretariat, Black South West Network (BSWN), has contributed to planning and direction for 2021/22.

b) External

Participants and contributors to the work of CoRE include:

- Stand Against Racism & Inequality (SARI)
- Identifying Disproportionality subcommittee
- Race Equality Steering Group
- Avon and Somerset Lammy Review Group
- Fast Track Cities 2 Steering Group
- Independent Care Board
- Avon and Somerset Constabulary
- Independent Commission on Equity in Cricket
- NHS Race and Health Observatory.
- Avon and Somerset Constabulary' Women's Independent Advisory Group
- Strategic Independent Advisory Group
- Bristol Youth Justice Partnership Board
- Education & Skills Race Equality Group
- Integrated Care System Independent Advisory Group
- SEND Improvement Board

Context

CoRE was set up by Bristol's Mayor, Marvin Rees, in response to the Bristol Manifesto for Race Equality, to look at race and ethnicity discrimination in Bristol. Bristol has a long-standing history of challenging inequality, and this is reflected in the core principles developed in memory of Batook Pandya, as a precursor to Bristol's Manifesto for promoting race equality. The need for this Commission is long-standing but now, as we move into a new era of post Covid-19 and Brexit, CoRE can play a critical role in furthering race equality in Bristol.

The key functions of the Commission include:

- Ensure the effective engagement of Black, Asian and Minority Ethnic communities in the city
- Provide challenges to public, private, and voluntary institutions and organisations in relation to race equality.
- Engage with policy and strategy developers to inform processes to ensure that race equality is embedded into planning, delivery, and outcomes.
- Engage with organisations and institutions (regardless of their geographical coverage) whose operations impact directly on the Black and Minoritised communities of Bristol.
- Provide independent scrutiny, including through collaboration with The Bristol Strategic Race Equality Leaders Group, Learning City Partnership, One City Partnership Boards, HR Race Strategic Leaders Group and Bristol Equality Charter Network.
- Progress a strategic action plan to be reviewed annually.

The Commission's focus included to:

- Create strategic partnerships with all political parties in the council.
- Raise public awareness of CoRE, increase engagement and enable the public to hold statutory bodies to account by organising meetings in public concentrating on Health, Education and Criminal Justice.
- Provide full transparency of CoRE processes.
- Submit evidence to the Independent Commission for Equity in Cricket in order to create change in recreational cricket in Bristol.
- Offer expertise on Equality, Diversity and Inclusion for public and private bodies.
- Work with the Research Action Coalition for Race Equality (RACE), the South West Race Equality Action Group (SWREAG), BSWN and others to help gather the data and evidence that will help us achieve our goals in Bristol. This is to ensure a baseline set of indicators is attained in all key social policy areas such as education, health, housing, criminal justice and employment to equip commissioners with the information and data required to adequately hold institutions in the city to account, when meeting with public and private stakeholders.

1. Update on activities since last report (undertaken between October 2021 and September 2022)

1.1 November Away Day

On the 24th of November 2021, the Chair held an Away Day for commissioners to discuss aims for CoRE in 2023 and how the Council can better support CoRE. Also present at the meeting was Deputy Mayor Cllr Asher Craig who had supported the Commission since its formation.

Outcomes from the meeting included:

- The Chair will accept the responsibility of being principal spokesperson for the Commission and will represent CoRE to advocate for its mission and purposes, giving more visible leadership.
- The Chair will work actively to shape and influence other strategic partners within Bristol's ecosystem of racial equality organisations, notably through the City Council sponsored Race Equality Strategic Leaders Group and One City Boards.
- CoRE needs to work with the Research Action Coalition for Race Equality (RACE), the South West Race Equality Action Group (SWREAG), BSWN and other organisations to help gather the data and evidence regarding racial discrimination in Bristol. This is to ensure a baseline set of indicators is attained in all key social policy areas such as education, health, housing, criminal justice and employment, to equip commissioners with the information and data required to adequately hold institutions in the city to account when meeting with public and private stakeholders.
- CoRE will reform the current Task Group structure by amending their Terms of Reference, reviewing their membership and ensuring commissioners are engaging with the relevant stakeholders and statutory organisations.

- CoRE will begin outreach with community stakeholders in response to previous community consultations, for example through public meetings in City Hall, networking events and inviting guests to private CoRE meetings.
- CoRE will develop a Communications strategy for social media (mainly Twitter and LinkedIn) to increase engagement and awareness.

1.2 Criminal Justice task group - Lead: Maya Mate-Kole

1.2.1 Scrutiny

1.2.1.1 Identifying Disproportionality within the Avon and Somerset Criminal Justice System

In March 2022 the *Identifying Disproportionality within Avon and Somerset Criminal Justice System* report was launched, chaired by Desmond Brown (CoRE Criminal Justice task group member). The Youth Justice Chapter was led by Criminal Justice Task Group Chair Maya Mate-Kole. The report outlined racial disproportionality, systemic racism and ended with 83 recommendations. This was followed by a call to action from CoRE to all stakeholders, and a follow up event hosted by CoRE with the Avon & Somerset Constabulary Chief Constable at City Hall to answer questions posed by the public in terms of response, next steps and accountability in May 2022. The Criminal Justice Task Group went on to present and explore the *Identifying disproportionality within Avon & Somerset Criminal Justice System* report to the Race Equality Strategic Leaders' Group at the *Race in the City 2: Spotlight on Criminal Justice* event in May and the South West Race Equality Action Group in April.

The Task Group held a meeting with the Avon and Somerset Office of Police and Crime Commissioner (OPCC) to explore structure of the *Identifying Disproportionality* recommendations LCJB sub-committee and to offer advice on how race equity expertise and anti-racist practice can be embedded in work and implementation of recommendations. The Task Group also invited OPCC to consider how lived experience and a collaborative approach can be utilised in measuring outcome, and the need for investment in community generated data.

The Task Group Chair, Maya Mate-Kole agreed to establish Identifying Disproportionality Scrutiny Group to monitor and scrutinise progress and implementation of recommendations by the Identifying Disproportionality Recommendations LCJB sub-committee chaired by Avon and Somerset Constabulary's Chief Constable. The Terms of Reference for the scrutiny group have been drafted, and this will progress to invitation for onboarding following an update from the Identifying Disproportionality Recommendations LCJB sub-committee and timeline. This group will be made up of members from relevant local and grassroots organisations, those with lived experience from minoritised communities and criminal justice expertise.

1.2.1.2 Working with the Avon and Somerset Constabulary (ASC) and Independent Office of Police Conduct (IOPC)

In May 2022, the Task Group Chair was asked to offer objective scrutiny of ASC investigation into the assault by an adult white woman on a 12-year-old Black young person which resulted in injury. The Task Group Chair advised of the need to diversify perspectives and community voice, so instead engaged individuals who identified an interest from the Black Community Collective to offer independent scrutiny and review of investigation.

The Task Group was requested by the Independent Office of Police Conduct (IOPC) to contribute to the Stop & Search Super Complaint Investigation. The Chair attended a roundtable event in September 2022 to explore harms caused by the use of Section 60 Criminal Justice and Public Order Act 1994 stop and searches and the inadequate scrutiny of stop and search powers.

We held meetings with the IOPC Engagement Office to review their community engagement strategy. We raised concerns regarding the lack of trust in the body by minoritised communities and the lack of accountability for police misconduct within Black and minoritised communities. The Task Group Chair and members joined the Inclusive Policing Delivery Group contributing to strategy and delivery plans in relation to anti racist policing and best practice.

The Avon and Somerset Constabulary senior leaders have continued to attend CJS task group to allow regular reviews of community engagement strategy, raise concerns in relation to police in schools and interrogate general practice, specifically anti racist practice.

CoRE continues to be represented in Avon and Somerset Constabulary's Women's Independent Advisory Group and Strategic Independent Advisory Group and Bristol Youth Justice Partnership Board.

1.2.2 Training

The Task Group agreed to review the Avon and Somerset Constabulary cultural intelligence training and policing with confidence evaluation, once completed. There is opportunity for the Task Group to review and give feedback on the Avon and Somerset Constabulary's new Stop and Search CPD package for officers.

1.2.3 Equality Impact Assessments & Commissioning

We held a meeting with Avon & Somerset Constabulary to interrogate use of Equality Impact Assessments and review processes. We also offered expertise to the upcoming Equality Impact Assessment (EIA) of Stop and Search, including consideration of how the Black lived experience can be included in the process.

CoRE established a partnership between the Criminal Justice Alliance and the Avon & Somerset Constabulary to collaborate on the EIA tool kit. Representatives from the Task Group are also members of the CJA Tackling Racial Inequality Project continuing to support this workstream and EIA toolkit development.

The Chair of the Task Group held a meeting with Director of Policy and Partnerships from Avon and Somerset Police & Crime Commissioner's Office to interrogate how the OPCC can ensure services commissioned are representative of victims of crime from minoritised groups. The group scrutinised what service gap analysis can be undertaken to ensure the needs of minoritised communities are identified and appropriate services can be sought and commissioned. Exploration and recommendations made to ensure that procurement and commissioning processes are inclusive and accessible for Black led businesses and other grassroots community organisations.

1.2.4 Community Engagement

The Task Group hosted an introductory meeting with Safer Options and local solicitors to share Rights & Responsibilities workshop model that was piloted, so a collaboration could be formed and workshop series could be delivered with local community groups, parenting groups and education settings.

The Task Group began planning an upcoming community event: *Understanding the Criminal Justice system: Rights & Responsibilities* and to include IOPC, CPS, Judiciary, OPCC and Policing.

1.3 Education task group - Lead: Fatima Mohamed Ali and Margaret Simmons-Bird

The Education Task Group played a critical role in the planning and delivery of a very successful Race in the City event “A Spotlight on Education” on the 19th May via Zoom, 109 participants signed up for a very popular event with a stimulating and challenging agenda. We had a wide range of schools and academies across the City, partners in Health, Social Care, Criminal Justice, Voluntary sector, Universities, FE college, Counsellors, the Independent school sector and other partners. The presentations were well received and we had some brilliant speakers covering supporting EAL, Raising the attainment of Black Caribbean and mixed Black Caribbean boys currently the group that is underperforming significantly and over represented in school suspensions and exclusions; over representation of pupils from minoritised communities in specialist provision. The presentations were predominantly given by school leaders to demonstrate the work being undertaken to challenge racial inequalities in schools and settings. Feedback from the event was overwhelmingly positive with a keen enthusiasm to share the good practice more widely and follow up through resourcing from BCC.

Commissioners continue to co-chair the Education & Skills Race Equality Group, however, the resignation of Alison Hurley has slowed the progress and the work of this group. Promised resources to extend the work in Secondary school has not materialised. Attendance at meetings are declining and this needs to be addressed quickly. There is too much talking and not enough action. There is no senior officer with responsibility for race equality work and to follow up actions following meetings, which is disappointing. A new Partnership Plan: *Promoting Race Equality & Antiracist Education in Bristol 2022-24* has been produced but no resources attached.

Margaret Simmons-Bird presented a research report to the SEND Improvement Board 6th September 2022 titled *Understanding Representation Prevalence and Uptake of SEND among BAME pupils in Bristol*. The report was well received, however; due to COVID it was not possible to interview parents and pupils identified with SEND in schools and settings. The finding raises considerable concern about the overrepresentation of pupils from minoritised communities in specialist provision. Further work is needed to get the experience of parents and pupils. The Board asked for an Action Plan to be drawn up on how this work will be followed up.

CoRE sits on the Children & Young People’s Board and has contributed to the Task & Finish Group and was a member of the Stakeholder panel in the successful recruitment of Abi Gbago, the new Director of Children Services.

Margaret Simmons-Bird gave a presentation at the relaunch of The Black Governor Network in April to put CoRE support for the recruitment of more governors from Black and minoritised backgrounds.

1.4 Health and wellbeing task group - Lead: Euella Jackson

The Commission has considered national data such as the 2021 NHS Race and Health Observatory report ‘Ethnic Health Inequalities and the NHS’ that asserts that “the NHS has not made significant progress in reducing ethnic health inequalities in recent years because it has not acted on this issue as a clear priority”. However we have been investing time getting to understand our local context and the specificity of the issues around racial inequalities for people trying to access Healthcare provision in Bristol.

In April we held a session with Health and Wellbeing Practitioners in the city at Bristol City Hall. This was part of a consultation process to explore how to move forward in ensuring the health and wellbeing provision for

Bristol's global majority communities is accessible, fit for purpose and ensures that we can hold the NHS and other health care providers to account. From that meeting came numerous actions such as:

- Sourcing more up to date local data around racial health inequalities in the city
- Mapping the current provision and influencing bodies in the city
- Understanding what post-covid recovery looks like for health equality in the city
- Holding the local NHS bodies to account

During the meeting it felt pertinent that CoRE be involved in the Integrated Care Systems' (ICS) setting up of an Independent Advisory Group (IAG) as an opportunity to drive accountability and ensure addressing racial health inequality remains a priority.

On 5th May, the Health and Wellbeing chair, Euella Jackson, represented the CoRE at the ICS's IAG Stakeholder Initial Meeting, chaired by Jeff Farrar, where she fed in the commission's feedback on the process in ensuring that the ICS will be held accountable to the community and those who deliver the care and wellbeing provision the community needs. The ICS subsequently put forward a draft terms of reference for the IAG, that the commission reviewed and sent back our comments on the 30th May. Around the same time, we reviewed and fed into the Race Equality Covid-19 Steering Group Evaluation Draft Report from Saffron Karlsen and Rosa Targett and fed in comments.

On the 20th July, the Commission hosted a public panel discussion looking into the Racial Disparities and Inequalities in Health and Wellbeing, hosted by CoRe Chair Museji Takolia CBE and hearing from Dr Jeff Farrar QPM, Dr Habib Naqvi MBE, Dr Saffron Karlsen and Asha Mohamed. The discussion from this brought to light key actions, pressures that the task group can take forward on behalf of the community in relation to the ICB's IAG. This included:

- Ensuring that Equality Diversity and Inclusion (EDI) becomes a central theme and metric to the ICB leadership and using data to help them recognise the role structural racism plays in these disparities.
- More money and resources put into the creating data-driven policy in the ICB
- Creating collaborative solutions to issues around addressing racial disparities that are co-created by the community, workforce and leadership.
- Capturing lessons from project-level that can be implemented across-the board.

However, this is still ongoing conversation and on the 6th October, the ICS board met to review the Terms of Reference for the IAG and discuss appointing a chair who will lead on this.

On 18th October, Euella will represent the Commission at the ICS' Partnership Day, a workshop day bringing together key decision makers with members of the community to decide the system priorities that the Integrated Care Systems strategy will try to solve and build into the design. She will be ensuring that addressing racial disparities remains at the top of the agenda.

In conversation with the CoRE Community taskgroup, Euella is drafting a H&W engagement strategy in order for CoRE to remain connected to the community and our stakeholders. Euella has been sitting on the Fast Track

Cities 2 Steering Group - supporting the city's work to reduce HIV stigma and raise testing among Black African and Caribbean communities in Bristol. She has been advising on several interventions through their Common Ambition Bristol project that specifically targets Black African and Caribbean communities. She has also recently connected with Bristol Health Partners Health Weight Management Integration Team as they draw up their coming priorities for addressing racial disparities. This is the type of work that can continue through the H&W engagement strategy to ensure the commission remains visible to our community stakeholders and communication channels remain open.

1.4.1 Aims for the future

Moving forward, the Commission's key priorities are:

- Using the NHS Race and Observatory recommendations to ensure addressing health disparities is a key focus of the ICB through the IAG.
- Developing a strong engagement strategy, to ensure the commission remains visible to community stakeholders to connect with influencing bodies and share the most recent, local and national data trends.
- Supporting Bristol City Council and Integrated Care Board to develop data-driven policy to tackle racial disparities for health and wellbeing patients and staff.
- Continue to feed into local (and where appropriate, national) discussions, shaping the key priorities and focus of health care providers in the city.
- Making the case for more resources being invested into delivering data-driven, proven interventions to address racial health inequalities.
- Bolster membership of the H&W advisory board.

1.5. Resignations and Appointments

CoRE has received resignations from the following commissioners over the last 12 months due to other work commitments:

- Maya Mate-Kole
- Dr. Marie Annick Gournet
- Zahra Kosar

We extend our sincere thanks to them for their service, dedication and contributions, and wish them well.

The following commissioners will continue to serve through 2022-23:

- Abbigael Bainton, Assistant Principal and Science Teacher at Bristol Brunel Academy
- Dr Adeela Shafi, Associate Professor in Education, University of Gloucestershire; Founding member of Bristol Muslim Strategic Leadership Group (BMSLG)
- Enitan Amorolaran, Matter Support Paralegal RPC
- Margaret Simmons-Bird, Education Consultant & Executive Lead for School Improvement at Wellsway Multi Academy Trust
- Fatima Mohamed Ali, Teacher at Cabot Primary School
- Jane Khawaja, Head of Research Development at University of Bristol
- Forward Maisokwadzo, Inclusion Advisor to the Mayor's Office
- Euella Jackson, Engagement Producer and Talent Manager at Rising Arts Agency
- Marcus Walters, Senior Associate at Burges Salmon LLP

- Jendayi Serwah, Convenor of the Afrikan ConneXions Consortium

CoRE is in the process of recruiting three new commissioners, including the 2021-22 Youth Mayors. CoRE is supported by Rebecca Baldwin-Cantello, Head of Equality and Inclusion at Bristol City Council.

2. Policy contributions

2.1 Meetings in Public

As part of its objectives to influence and hold to account city, sub-regional and regional leaders who have significant influence on Bristol, the Commission hosted a series of public meetings with city leaders to discuss progress in areas such as criminal justice, education, and health. Policy briefs detailing key issues discussed in each meeting were published on the CoRE website.

CoRE facilitated a relationship with Stand Against Racism and Inequality (SARI). The Chair invited the Director and Assistant Director of SARI to private meetings to provide local data on hate crime in Bristol and the South West in order to gain an understanding of racial discrimination in the city. CoRE continues to refer individuals to SARI in order to get appropriate support for race-based hate crime.

Racism and inequality in education was the focus of the CoRE meetings on the 23rd of March, 2022. The Education Task Group held its first meeting in public with the Director of Education and Skills, Alison Hurly to understand how Bristol City Council is tackling racial inequality in education on the 23rd of March, 2022. A policy brief was produced summarising racial disparities in education in Bristol and critiquing the solutions presented by Alison Hurly.

On the 25th May 2022, CoRE held its second meeting in public at City Hall, which focused on criminal justice and the *Identifying Disproportionality in the Avon and Somerset Criminal Justice System* report commissioned by the Avon and Somerset Criminal Board. Members of the public were invited to listen to presentations from Claire Hiscott, Deputy Police and Crime Commissioner for Avon and Somerset (OPCC), Desmond Brown, Chair of the Avon and Somerset Lammy Sub-Group, and Sarah Crew, Chief Constable of the Avon and Somerset Constabulary (ASC). The report concluded with 83 recommendations concentrating on Human Resources, Prisons, Out of Court Disposals, Youth Justice and Stop and Search.

The Health and Wellbeing Task Group held a public meeting on racial disparities on the 20th July 2022 at City Hall. The Health and Wellbeing Task Group hosted a panel with keynote speaker Dr Habib Naqvi MBE, Director of the NHS Race and Health Observatory; Dr Jeff Farrar QPM, Chair of the Integrated Care System for Bristol, North Somerset and South Gloucestershire; Asha Mohamed, Managing Director of Caafi Health; and Dr Saffron Karlsen, Associate Lecturer of Sociology at the University of Bristol.

2.2 Racism in Cricket

Following Azeem Rafiq's testimony in Parliament about his experiences at the Yorkshire County Cricket Club, the Commission initiated a local consultation in December 2021. It is clear from the growing body of evidence; including that reported to the ECWCB's own Independent Commission on Equity in Cricket (headed by Cindy Butts) that these few cases are not isolated. Indeed, there is a deeper malaise across the game at every level,

affecting people from all minority ethnic communities and we would like to see resolute action being taken here in Bristol and the region.

In December 2021, CoRE wrote to the main cricketing bodies responsible for the game in Bristol to begin engagement with them. As part of this letter, we asked them how they propose addressing these concerns as they impact on the game of cricket and how it is administered, governed, organised, and played in Bristol and just how seriously they are taking the issues that are unfolding about racism in the sport.

On the back of this, and as part of our evidence gathering for our submission to the ICEC, we held our first session with local cricket teams on the 8th of March to understand the experiences of Black and Minoritised players of cricket in our area. This was an informative session in which players discussed some harrowing scenes. These comments will be included in our submission to the ICEC once anonymised by the research team but much of this included physical and verbal abuse, being asked to present passports, and being told to create a separate league.

CoRE also met with the region's boards on the 13th of April to discuss how we might collaborate with them to maintain momentum on this issue and in particular; to find out how the administrators of the game in our area are going about implementing the ECB's Action Plan on Racial Equality. Our primary purpose was to engage with them, but we also want to support the leadership and facilitate the process through which the ECB Action Plan takes shape locally. We will submit our findings as part of a national call for evidence by the Independent Commission on Equity in Cricket (ICEC).

3. CoRE 2023 Aims

Moving into 2023, CoRE hopes to focus on the following areas:

- The Economy, Jobs and Skills Task Group will lead a public session in January 2023 with a focus on social value, procurement and recruitment in the upcoming Temple Quarter development. CoRE hopes to identify opportunities to spread the benefits of this investment to benefit local minoritised communities and businesses.
- Insights and policy development based on Census 2021 data will support the building of a 'Bristol Race Tracker' to monitor progress in key outcomes in key areas in the private and public sector.
- Research on the relationship between media organisations and their reporting about racial equality issues and Black leadership in Bristol.
- The Chair will lead consultation with partners on future sustainability and funding options that strengthen the leadership and impact through the various players in the Bristol race equality ecosystem, including reforms to current arrangements.
- Create a Communications strategy to increase awareness of CoRE in local communities.

4. Other Options Considered

None

5. Risk Assessment

None

6. Summary of Equality Impact

Section 149 of the Equality Act 2010 requires that each decision-maker considers the need to promote equality for persons with the following “protected characteristics”: age, disability, gender reassignment, pregnancy and maternity, race, religion or belief, sex, sexual orientation.

CoRE’s key objective lies in addressing racial inequality however we recognise that many of the challenges are cross-sectional and impact communities based on multiple characteristics. The following key requirements have been addressed accordingly:

a) To advance equality of opportunity between persons who share a relevant protected characteristic and those who do not share it.

Through events and meetings such as the series of meetings in public conducted throughout the year, CoRE strives to encourage cross-sectoral and city-wide input into the work of the commission and facilitate conversation and networking between business owners, community organisations, and local community members of all backgrounds.

7. Revenue

CoRE request the Council to continue with the annual funding of £5,000 for the Commission’s function and core activities, as well as use of Main Hall for events as appropriate post-Covid-19.